This record is a partial extract of the original cable. The full text of the original cable is not available.

UNCLAS SECTION 01 OF 05 ROME 002999

SIPDIS

SENSITIVE

STATE FOR SCIENCE ADVISOR NEUREITER EUR/ERA FOR HEN-NIL EB FOR GADSEN EB/TPP/ATT FOR PEREZ

UNCLASSIFIED

ROME 02999 01 OF 05 191328Z PAGE 02 USDA/FAS:BLUM USDA/FAS/ITT:EJONES USDA/FAS/OA:SLUTSKY USDA/OS/HEGWOOD STATE PASS FDA FOR EFLAMM EPA FOR OFFICE OF ADMINISTRATOR NSC FOR EDSON, CLOUD

E.O. 12958: N/A

TAGS: EAGR ETRO TSPL TBIO EAID IT ITEAGR ITEAGR ITEAGR SUBJECT: GOOD AND BAD SCIENCE TAKE CENTER STAGE IN BIOTECH

REF: A. A. ROME 1965

¶B. B. ROME 2765

- 11. (U) THIS CABLE IS SENSTIVE BUT UNCLASSIFIED. IT IS NOT INTENDED FOR DISTRIBUTION ON THE INTERTET.
- 12. (U) THIS IS AN ACTION MESSAGE FOR OES WHICH REQUESTS REPLY TO REF A TRANSMITTED APRIL 22, 2002. ALSO SEE PARA 19.
- 13. (SBU) SUMMARY. THE ROLE OF SCIENCE IN THE ITALIAN BIOTECHNOLOGY DEBATE IS GROWING, THANKS IN PART TO EMBASSY EFFORTS. IN THE LAST TEN DAYS, TWO DEBATES FEATURING LEADING U.S. AND ITALIAN SCIENTISTS HAVE BEEN WELL COVERED BY THE MEDIA AND HAVE THROWN INTO QUESTION THE UNSCIENTIFIC UNCLASSIFIED
- PAGE 03 ROME 02999 01 OF 05 191328Z
 FOUNDATIONS USED BY AGMIN ALEMANNO TO POSIT HIS "TIME FOR CHOICES" WHITE PAPER. ALEMANNO'S TEAM IS REGARDED WITH SKEPTICISM AND EVEN CONTEMPT BY THE ITALIAN SCIENTIFIC COMMUNITY. AT THE MINISTER'S JUNE 4 STAGE-MANAGED PUBLIC ROLL-OUT OF HIS WHITE PAPER, OUTDATED AND SUPERSEDED RESEARCH WAS PRESENTED AS GOSPEL, SECONDED BY A THEOLOGIAN, AND COMMENTED ON FROM THE FLOOR BY A PRESELECTED GROUP OF PRO-ALEMANNO, ANTI-GMO PROPONENTS.
- 14. (SBU) SUMMARY CONTINUED. OTHER ELEMENTS OF THE GOI APPEAR MORE AND MORE WILLING TO ENDORSE SCIENCE AND RESEARCH AS A WAY TO OPPOSE THE ALEMANNO LUDDITES AND THEIR ANTI-GMO PROPOSALS. THE MINISTRY OF ENVIRONMENT, IN ON-THE-RECORD ADDRESSES AT THE DG AND U/S LEVELS, ENDORSED THE NEED FOR SCIENCE-BASED POLICY, STRONG U.S.-ITALIAN RESEARCH COOPERATION, AND USING THAT COOPERATION TO REOPEN A BROADER U.S.-EU DIALOGUE DURING THE 2003 ITALIAN PRESIDENCY. THE PM'S NATIONAL BIOTECHNOLOGY COMMISSION PRESIDENT HAS SPOKEN SIMILARLY, AND TOLD US WE SHOULD EXPECT ENDORSEMENT OF THE PRINCIPLES OF COOPERATION DOCUMENT DESCRIBED REF A FROM THE PM'S OFFICE BY THE END OF JUNE. LAST, BUT BY NO MEANS LEAST, THE PRIME MINISTER, CONTINUING TO FIND HIS WAY WITH CAUTION, HAS SAID THAT ITALY MUST REMAIN OPEN TO RESEARCH, AND LOOK TO THE EXPERIENCE OF OTHER COUNTRIES. THIS IS AN OPPORTUNITY WE SHOULD NOT FAIL TO EXPLOIT. SEE EMBASSY ANALYSIS STARTING PARA 16.END SUMMARY.

RAISING THE BAR ON FEAR-MONGERING?

- (U) THE ITALIAN SCIENTIFIC COMMUNITY HAS REMAINED STEADFASTLY PRO-BIOTECHNOLOGY, BUT HAS BEEN RELUCTANT TO UNCLASSIFIED
- UNCLASSIFIED

 PAGE 04 ROME 02999 01 OF 05 191328Z

 EXPRESS ITS VIEWS DUE TO FEARS OF REPRISALS FROM
 GOVERNMENT(E.G. DISCRIMINATORY CUTBACKS IN ALREADY SCARCE
 RESEARCH FUNDING) AND ACTIONS BY ANTI-GMO GROUPS WHO HAVE
 DISRUPTED OR DESTROYED EXPERIMENTS INVOLVING GMO PLANTS AT A
 RESEARCH PLOT NEAR VITERBO AS RECENTLY AS TWO WEEKS AGO. IN
 THE FIRST DAYS OF THE BERLUSCONI GOVERNMENT, THERE WAS HOPE
 THAT A PRO-SCIENCE, PRO-BUSINESS GOVERNMENT WOULD ACT QUICKLY
 TO OPEN THE WAY FOR RESUMED BIOTECHNOLOGY RESEARCH. IN THE
 LAST SIX MONTHS, AS THE CONTOURS OF ALEMANNO'S ANTI-BIOTECH
 POLICIES HAVE BECOME CLEARER, THAT HOPE HAS FADED.
 SCIENTISTS NOW BELIEVE THAT THE PRIME MINISTER ALONE CAN
 OPPOSE ALEMANNO'S PROPOSED POLICY, AND THEY ARE TRYING TO
 HELP EXPOSE THE SHABBY SCIENTIFIC UNDERPINNINGS OF THE
 AGRICULTURE MINISTER'S WHITE PAPER BY CONDUCTING THEIR OWN
 PROGRAMS WHICH SHOW THE BENEFITS OF THE TECHNOLOGY.
- 16. (SBU) THE SCIENTISTS ARE ASSISTED IN THEIR EFFORTS TO CREATE A PUBLIC FOR THEIR DISCUSSIONS BY A HANDFUL OF ORGANIZATIONS. PROMINENT AMONG THEM HAS BEEN THE EINAUDI FOUNDATION, WHOSE "OBSERVATORY FOR BIOETHICS" HAS SPONSORED A NUMBER OF PRO-BIOTECHNOLOGY PROGRAMS IN THE LAST YEAR. MOST RECENTLY, ON MAY 31 AND JUNE 1, THE EINAUDI FOUNDATION ORGANIZED A TWO DAY PROGRAM ON PLANT VACCINES AND ENHANCING NUTRITION IN FOODS USING BIOTECHNOLOGY. ABOUT 250 PEOPLE,

UNCLASSIFIED

UNCLASSIFIED PTO4238

ROME 02999 02 OF 05 191328Z PAGE 01 ACTION EUR-00

INFO LOG-00 NP-00 AGRE-00 AID-00 ITCE-00 CEA-01 CIAE-00 COME-00 SRPP-00 VC-00 L-00 CTME-00 DODE-00 DOEE-00 DOTE-00 MEDE-00 UTED-00 ITC-01 OPIC-01 EB-00 HHS-01 EXME-00 H-01 E-00 TEDE-00 FAAE-00 INR-00 FRB-00 NASA-01 NSAE-00 OES-01 PM-00 AC-01 OMB-01 ACE-00 SSO-00 ECA-00 TRSE-00 NFAT-00 SP-00 SS-00 STR-00 TEST-00 USIE-00 EPAE-00 /011W PMB-00

----BF77D2 191329Z /38

R 191350Z JUN 02 FM AMEMBASSY ROME TO SECSTATE WASHDC 4327 HQ EPA WASHDC USDA WASHDC NSC WASHDC INFO EU MEMBER STATES COLLECTIVE AMCONSUL FLORENCE AMCONSUL MILAN AMCONSUL NAPLES

UNCLAS SECTION 02 OF 05 ROME 002999

STPDTS

SENSITIVE

STATE FOR SCIENCE ADVISOR NEUREITER EUR/ERA FOR HEN-NIL EB FOR GADSEN

UNCLASSIFIED

PAGE 02 ROME 02999 02 OF 05 191328Z
EB/TPP/ATT FOR PEREZ
E FOR SHUB
OES A/S TURNER, PDAS ROCK
STATE PASS USTR FOR STROJE, NOVELLI
STATE PASS USDA FOR APHIS:SMCCAMMON
USDA/FAS:BLUM
USDA/FAS/ITT:EJONES USDA/FAS/ITT:EJONES USDA/FAS/OA:SLUTEKY USDA/OS/HEGWOOD STATE PASS FDA FOR EFLAMM EPA FOR OFFICE OF ADMINISTRATOR NSC FOR EDSON, CLOUD

TAGS: EAGR ETRO TSPL TBIO EAID IT ITEAGR ITEAGR ITEAGR SUBJECT: GOOD AND BAD SCIENCE TAKE CENTER STAGE IN BIOTECH

MOSTLY PRO-BIOTECH, ATTENDED THIS PROGRAM AT THE CENTER FOR NATIONAL RESEARCH. DR. CHARLES ARNTZEN OF ARIZONA STATE UNIVERSITY, SUPPORTED IN PART BY THE EMBASSY, WAS THE MAIN U.S. SPEAKER. DR. INGO POTRYKUS, INVENTOR OF GOLDEN RICE, LED THE NUTRITIONAL ENHANCEMENT DISCUSSIONS. THE MAIN TALK: WERE BROADCAST ON RADIO RADIKALE, AND LOCAL MEDIA AND PRESS THE MAIN TALKS INTERVIEWED DR. ARNTZEN.

- 17. (U) THE WORKSHOP WAS OPENED BY THE MINISTRY OF ENVIRONMENT (DG CLINI, WHO HAD TOLD US THE PREVIOUS DAY THAT THE MINISTER HAD AGREED TO EXPLORE A MORE OPEN APPROACH TO BIOTECHNOLOGY). THE BRIEF STATEMENT POINTED OUT THAT EUROPE WAS NOT, AND COULD NOT BE, GM FREE, THAT RESEARCH, INCLUDING UNCLASSIFIED
- PAGE 03 ROME 02999 02 OF 05 191328Z
 STRONG PARTNERSHIP WITH THE U.S, WAS ESSENTIAL TO
 UNDERSTANDING THE POTENTIAL OF BIOTECHNOLOGY, AND THAT ITALY
 HAD TO TAKE POLICY DECISIONS IN A EUROPEAN AND LARGER
 CONTEXT. EST COUNS SPOKE ON THE NEED FOR POSITIVE
 STEWARDSHIP IN POLICY FORMULATION WITH PARTICULAR NEED TO
 SEPARATE EMOTIONAL SPECULATION AND OPINION POLLS FROM THE
 VERIFIABLE AND SYSTEMATIC INQUIRIES OF SCIENCE. LEONARDI
 SANTI, PRESIDENT OF THE PRIME MINISTER'S COMMITTEE ON
 BIOTECHNOLOGY, SAID THAT ITALY WOULD SON CONCLUDE AN
 AGREEMENT ON RESEARCH WITH THE U.K. AND THAT THE PM'S OFFICE
 STRONGLY SUPPORTED A RESEARCH AGREEMENT WITH THE UNITED
- (U) ARNTZEN AND POTRYKUS WERE THE MOST EFFECTIVE SPEAKERS. ARNIZEN AND POINTAINS WERE THE MOST EFFECTIVE
 SPEAKERS. ARNIZED OUTLINED RESEARCH WHICH PROMISED AN EDIBLE
 PLANT-BASED VACCINE FOR HEPATITIS B WITHIN 5 YEARS. POTRYKUS
 DELIVERED A CHILLING CRITICISM OF THE EU REGULATORY SYSTEM
 THAT WAS HAMPERING THE DISSEMINATION OF GOLDEN RICE AND OTHER
 NUTRITIONAL ENHANCEMENTS, SUCH AS IRON, WHICH HE CLAIMED
 COULD SAVE UP TO 40,000 LIVES A DAY IN THE DEVELOPING WORLD.
- 19. (U) ON JUNE 6, ASSOBIOTECH, THE NATIONAL INDUSTRIAL ASSOCIATION, PRESENTED A HALF-DAY PROGRAM TO PRESENT A STUDY OF TRALIAN "TYPICAL" PRODUCTS AT RISK FROM PESTS AND DISEASES WHICH COULD BE IMPROVED BY BIOTECHNOLOGIES. PROFESSOR FRANCESCO SALA OF THE UNIVERSITY OF MILAN INTRODUCED THE STUDY, AND HIS PRESENTATION WAS SUPPORTED BY OTHER SCIENTISTS, WHOSE REMARKS WERE INTERRUPTED BY THE SHOUTS OF ABOUT A DOZEN LEGAMBIENTE (ITALY'S MAJOR ENVIRONMENTAL NGO) PROTESTORS FROM THE STREET BELOW.

UNCLASSIFIED

- PAGE 04 ROME 0299 02 OF 05 191328Z
 110. (SBU) IMPORTANT REMARKS WERE MADE BY MINISTRY OF
 ENVIRONMENT U/S TORTOLI, WHO PLACED BIOTECHNOLOGIES IN
 AGRICULTURE IN A SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT CONTEXT, SPOKE IN
 FAVOR OF U.S.-ITALY RESEARCH COOPERATION, A EUROPEAN NETWORK
 (AN IDEA PRESENTED A FEW DAYS EARLIER TO EST COUNS BY FORZA
 ITALIA SCIENCE ADVISOR ARATA), AND THE KEY ROLE ITALY COULD
 PLAY IN ITS 2003 EU PRESIDENCY. COMMENT: TORTOLI'S SPEECH WAS
 DRAFTED BY DG CLINI FOR THE MINISTER OF ENVIRONMENT.
 ASSOBIOTECH HAD SEEN AN EARLIER DRAFT OF THE SPEECH, AND
 ADVISED TORTOLI TO BE CAREFUL. HE WAS NOT, WHICH WE ASSUME
 REFIECTS A DECISION BY MIN OF ENVIRONMENT MATTEOLI TO MOVE
 MORE OPENLY IN OPPOSITION TO ALEMANNO'S MORE NATIONALISTIC
 POSITION. END COMMENT.
- 111. (U) THE MOST SURPRISING REMARKS OF THE DAY WERE MADE BY THE CHAIR OF THE SENATE AGRICULTURAL COMMITTEE, MAURIZIO RONCONI. OPENLY CRITICAL OF ALEMANNO'S POSITIONS, RONCONI CALLED FOR A POLICY OF REALISM, FOUNDED ON SCIENCE. HE ARGUED THAT GM FREE AGRICULTURE DID NOT EXIST IN ITALY NOW, THAT GMO FREE SEEDS WERE NOT AVAILABLE IN SUFFICIENT QUANTITIES, AND THAT A ZERO TOLERANCE POLICY WOULD NOT BENEFIT, BUT WOULD DAMAGE SMALL FARMERS WHO WOULD HAVE TO PAY A PREMIUM PRICE FOR SEEDS UNDER THE ALEMANNO POLICY. HE NOTED THAT NO "GM-FREE" CERTIFICATION SCHEMES WERE IN PLACE, AND THAT DESIGNING AND IMPLEMENTING A RELIABLE SCHEME WOULD BE

UNCLASSIFIED

PTO4237 UNCLASSIFIED

INFO LOG-00 AGRE-00 AID-00 DOEE-00 ITCE-00 NP-00 CEA-01 CIAE-00 COME-00 DOTE-00 UTED-00 VC-00 ITC-01 L-00 OPIC-01 PM-00 TEST-00 TRSE-00 '738 CTME-00 DODE-00 DOEE-00 MEDE-00 EXME-00 E-00 H-01 TEDE-00 NSAE-00 OES-01 EB-00 HHS-01 AC-01 FAAE-00 INR-00 OMB-01 FRB-00 NASA-01 ACE-00 SP-00 SSO-00 SS-00 STR-00 USIE-00 EPAE-00 PMB-00 /011W DRL-02 G-00 ---BF77F7

R 191350Z JUN 02 FM AMEMBASSY ROME TO SECSTATE WASHDC 4328 HQ EPA WASHDC USDA WASHDC USDA WASHDC INFO EU MEMBER STATES COLLECTIVE AMCONSUL FLORENCE AMCONSUL MILAN AMCONSUL NAPLES

UNCLAS SECTION 03 OF 05 ROME 002999

SIPDIS

SENSITIVE

STATE FOR SCIENCE ADVISOR NEUREITER EUR/ERA FOR HEN-NIL EB FOR GADSEN EB/TPP/ATT FOR PEREZ

UNCLASSIFIED

PAGE 02 ROME 02999 03 OF 05 1913292
E FOR SHUB
OES A/S TURNER, PDAS ROCK
STATE PASS USTR FOR STROJE, NOVELLI
STATE PASS USDA FOR APHIS:SMCCAMMON
USDA/FAS:BLUM
USDA/FAS:BLUM
USDA/FAS/ITT:EJONES
USDA/FAS/OA:SLUTSKY
USDA/OS/HEGWOOD
STATE PASS FDA FOR EFLAMM
EPA FOR OFFICE OF ADMINISTRATOR
NSC FOR EDSON, CLOUD

E.O. 12958: N/A

TAGS: EAGR ETRD TSPL TBIO EAID IT ITEAGR ITEAGR ITEAGR SUBJECT: GOOD AND BAD SCIENCE TAKE CENTER STAGE IN BIOTECH

COSTLY. HE ADDED THAT LOMBARDIA, AMONG ITALY'S MOST IMPORTANT AGRICULTURAL AREAS, WAS SOLIDLY AGAINST A GM-FREE POLICY. CONCLUSION? ITALY NEEDS MORE RESEARCH AND FIELD TRIALS, AND LABELLING AIMED AT CONSUMERS' RIGHT TO MAKE AN INFORMED CHOICE.

- 112. (U) THE MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE WAS NOT PRESENT DURING THE FOREGOING PRESENTATIONS. WHEN HE ARRIVED, THE HECKLERS STOPPED HECKLING, AND ALEMANNO HAD THE FULL ATTENTION OF THE ROOM. FROM A NEUTRAL STATEMENT ABOUT THE VALUE OF RESEARCH, HE BRIDGED TO HIS FAMILIAR CLAIMS OF RISKS, OF THE CONTAMINATION OF ITALIAN VARIETIES BY GM VARIETIES, MENTIONING IN PASSING THAT THRESHOLDS WERE NOT A SCIENTIFIC, BUT A POLITICAL ISSUE, AND THAT ITALY'S PROBLEM IS QUALITY UNCLASSIFIED
- PAGE 03 ROME 02999 03 OF 05 191329Z
 AND SAFETY, NOT INCREASED PRODUCTION. ON FIELD TRIALS FOR
 GMOS, ALEMANNO SAID THAT COULD NOT TAKE PLACE UNTIL THE
 VARIETIES WERE PROVED SAFE FOR THE ENVIRONMENT—THE CONCEDED
 THAT HEALTH IS NO LONGER AN ISSUE—AND AN EFFECTIVE
 GM/GM-FREE "FILTER" HAD BEEN DEMONSTRATED. HE DID NOT OBJECT
 TO BEING COMPARED BY THE AUDIENCE TO FORMER GREEN PARTY AG
 MINISTER PECORARO SCANIO, AND SAID HE WOULD NOT ENCOURAGE
 INVESTORS IN AGRICULTURAL BIOTECHNOLOGY.
- 113. (SBU) COMMENT: REACTION TO ALEMANNO FROM THOSE ATTENDING WAS CONSIDERED DISMAY. MOST FOUND A SILVER LINING IN THE PRIME MINISTER'S REFUSAL TO CLOSE ITALY TO BIOTECHNOLOGY, ANNOUNCED IN BRIEF REMARKS AT THE JUNE 4 TAVOLA AGRIALIMENTARE IN THE PRESENCE OF ALEMMANO, BUT MANY CONCLUDED NO REAL DECISION WOULD BE TAKEN ON POLICY UNLESS ALEMANNO MOVED TO A DIFFERENT POSITION IN THE GOVERNMENT. ASSOBIOTECH PRESIDENT SERGIO DOMPE TOLD ESTCOUNS HE BELIEVES THAT BERLUSCONI WILL MOVE FORWARD, BUT WILL BE IN NO HURRY. THE GAME PLAN SEEMS TO BE CONTAINED REACTION TO ALEMANNO, NOT INITIATIVE BY THE PM. END COMMENT.

SCIENCE BOWS TO POLITICS: ALEMANNO AND A TIME FOR CHOICE

- 114. (U) ON JUNE 4, IN THE MIDDLE OF THE TWO WORKSHOPS DESCRIBED ABOVE, ALEMANNO CONDUCTED HIS OWN "SCIENTIFIC PROGRAM" AT LA SAPIENZA(UNIVERSITY OF ROME), WHERE HE DEBUTED PUBLICLY HIS WHITE PAPER TO AN AUDIENCE OF ABOUT 300. THERE WAS VIRTUALLY NO OVERLAP BETWEEN THE AUDIENCES ATTENDING THE SCIENTIFIC WORKSHOPS REPORTED ABOVE AND THE AUDIENCE ATTENDING THE ATTENDING THE ALEMANNO PROGRAM. ALEMANNO'S WARM-UP SPEAKERS INCLUDED NO BIOTECHNOLOGISTS, AND RESEARCH SUPPORTING THE UNCLASSIFIED
- PAGE 04 ROME 02999 03 OF 05 1913292 HIGH RISK OF GMOS TO THE ENVIRONMENT INCLUDED THE DISCREDITED MONARCH BUTTERFLY FINDINGS ORGINALLY REPORTED IN NATURE. ONE SERIOUS SCIENTIST ATTENDING THE PROGRAM TOLD EST COUNS THAT THE MOST CITED SCIENTIST ON THE ALEMANNO PANEL WAS A MICROBIOLOGIST WITH FOUR CITATIONS, TWO OF THEM IN A NON-PEER REVIEWED JOURNAL.
- 115. (U) THE PANEL AVOIDED PUBLIC DEBATE BY ALLOWING ONLY PRE-SCHEDULED INTERVENTIONS FROM ALEMANNO SUPPORTERS, EXCEPTING ONE INTERVENTION BY AN ASSOBIOTECH SPOKESMAN WHO WAS QUICKLY DISMISSED FOR HIS INDUSTRY BIAS. WHEN ALEMANNO TOOK THE STAGE FOR WHAT BECAME A HALF-HOUR BARBURER OF A SPEECH, HE PROCLAIMED THAT HE HAD HELED THE DIVIDE BETWEEN SCIENTISTS AND ENVIRONMENALISTS/FARMES/CONSUMERS, AND THAT HIS POLICY PROPOSAL, SOON TO BE INFORMED BY THE WORK OF A MULTIDISCIPLINARY TASK FORCE, WOULD INTRODUCE INTO THE PARLIAMENT A DEBATE TO HELP ITALY MAKE THE RIGHT CHOICE ABOUT GMOS. SINCE HE TOOK NO QUESTIONS FROM THE AUDIENCE, THERE WAS NO CHALLENGE TO HIS CLAIMS.

EMBASSY ANALYSIS: DOES SCIENCE MATTER IN THIS DEBATE?

116. (SBU) BIOTECH OPONENTS AND PROPONENTS ARE LAYING OUT

THEIR POSITINS BASED ON SCIENCE. IT'S JUST NOT THE SAME

UNCLASSIFIED

UNCLASSIFIED PTO4239

ROME 02999 04 OF 05 191329Z PAGE 01

ACTION EUR-00

INFO LOG-00 NP-00 AGRE-00 AID-00 ITCE-00 CEA-01 CIAE-00 SRPP-00 COME-00 CTME-00 DODE-00 DOEE-00 DOTE-00 MEDE-00 UTED-00 VC-00 ITC-01 L-00 OPIC-01 PM-00 TEST-00 TRSE-00 EB-00 HHS-01 EXME-00 H-01 E-00 TEDE-00 FAAE-00 INR-00 FRB-00 H-01 NSAE-00 OES-01 SSO-00 SS-00 AC-01 SP-00 OMB-01 ACE-00 STR-00 USTE-00 DRL-02 EPAE-00 PMB-00 G-00 NFAT-00 SAS-00 /011W --BF7809

R 191350Z JUN 02 TO SECSTATE WASHDC 4329
HQ EPA WASHDC
USDA WASHDC
NSC WASHDC INFO EU MEMBER STATES COLLECTIVE AMCONSUL FLORENCE AMCONSUL MILAN AMCONSUL NAPLES

UNCLAS SECTION 04 OF 05 ROME 002999

SIPDIS

SENSITIVE

STATE FOR SCIENCE ADVISOR NEUREITER EUR/ERA FOR HEN-NIL EB FOR GADSEN EB/TPP/ATT FOR PEREZ

UNCLASSIFIED

PAGE 02 ROME 02999 04 OF 05 191329Z PAGE UZ ROME UZ999 04 OF U E FOR SHUB OES A/S TURNER, PDAS ROCK STATE PASS USTR FOR STROJE, NOVELLI STATE PASS USDA FOR APHIS:SMCCAMMON USDA/FAS:BLUM USDA/FAS:ITT:EJONES USDA/FAS/OA:SLUTSKY USDA/FAS/OA:SLUTSNI USDA/OS/HEGWOOD STATE PASS FDA FOR EFLAMM EPA FOR OFFICE OF ADMINISTRATOR NSC FOR EDSON, CLOUD

SCIENCE. BIOTECH OPPONENTS USED OUTDATED, OFTEN DISCREDITED OR NON-PEER REVIEWED "RESEARCH" TO JUSTIFY THEIR POSITION. BIOTECH PROPONENTS, WHO KNOW THE SCIENCE, CAN EXPOSE THE SPECIOUS LOGIC UNDERLYING ALEMANNO'S POSITION BY REFERRING TO INTERNATIONALLY PEER-REVIEWED FINDINGS, AND STUDIES BY THE EUROPEAN COMMISSION AND OTHER BODIES. BY INTERNATIONALIZING THE DEBATE, BIOTECH SUPPORTERS REDUCE THE RISK OF PERSONAL RETRIBUTION, AND FORCE ALEMANNO'S NATIONALISTIC VIEW (WE WILL PROTECT OUR NATIONAL AGRICULTURAL HERITAGE BY CLOSING OUR POLITICAL BORDERS TO ALL BIOTECHNOLOGY) TO BE LOCKED AT IN INTERNATIONAL BIOLOGICAL, ECOLOGICAL, AND TRADE TERMS. THE POTENTIAL OF BIOTECHNOLOGY TO ADDRESS THE HEALTH AND AGRICULTURAL PRODUCTIVITY NEEDS OF THE DEVELOPING WORLD, DISMISSED BY ALEMANNO AS MINIMAL, CAN BE DEMONSTRATED BY UNCLASSIFIED

PAGE 03 ROME 02999 04 OF 05 191329Z
ARNTZEN AND POTRYKUS, BY SCIENTIFIC LEADERS LIKE NORMAN
BORLAUG AND PER PINSTRUP ANDERSEN WHO HAVE FIRST HAND
EXPERIENCE IN THE DEVELOPING WORLD, AND BY DEVELOPING WORLD
SCIENTISTS LIKE ROMANO KIOME FROM KENYA.

117. (SBU) ALEMANNO SIMPLY HAS NO SCIENTISTS OF DISTINCTION WHO SUPPORT HIS POINT OF VIEW. THE MORE WE TAKE HIM AT HIS WORD IN HIS ENDORSEMENT OF RESEARCH AND SPECIFICALLY OF RESEARCH WITH THE U.S.-HIS DG AMBROSIO TOLD EST COUNS AND AGMINCOUNS OVER LUNCH JUNE 7 THAT THE MINISTER WAS FULLY COMMITTED TO COLLABORATION, AND THAT ALL 24 OF THE AGMINISTRY'S INSTITUTES WERE AVAILABLE AND FAVORABLY DISPOSED-- THE MORE WE RAISE THE BAR ON THE SCIENTIFIC STANDARD ITALY WILL USE TO EVALUATE ITS POLICY OPTIONS ON BIOTECHNOLOGY. FURTHER, A STRONG PROGRAM OF VISITING U.S. SCIENTISTS, WHO ARE HELD IN HIGH REGARD, CREATES OPPORTUNITIES FOR PUBLIC MEETINGS WHICH INCREASE THE AMOUNT OF SCIENTIFIC INFORMATION IN CIRCULATION IN THE MEDIA AND AMONG CONSUMER AND ENVIRONMENTAL ORGANIZATIONS AS WELL AS TI (SBU) ALEMANNO SIMPLY HAS NO SCIENTISTS OF DISTINCTION OF SCIENTIFIC INFORMATION IN CIRCULATION IN THE MEDIA AND AMONG CONSUMER AND ENVIRONMENTAL ORGANIZATIONS AS WELL AS THE GENERAL PUBLIC. IN THE MEDIUM TERM WE COULD CREATE SOME HEALTHY SKEPTICISM ABOUT ALEMANNO'S NOSTALCIC VIEW OF ITALIAN AGRICULTURE AND THE THREATENING MANNER WHICH HE PRESENTS BIOTECHNOLOGY.

118. (SBU) THIS DOESN'T MEAN SCIENCE WILL EASILY WIN THE DAY. AS HE LOSES GROUND IN THE SCIENCE DEBATE--AND WE WILL REPORT SEPTEL ON THE BILATERAL DIMENSIONS OF THE BIOTECH DEBATE SPARKED BY THE FAO SUMMIT-- WE FULLY EXPECT A REMEWED RESORT TO EMOTIONALISM AND ANTI-GMO DEMONSTRATIONS BY GREEN ORGANIZATIONS. THESE WILL ATTRACT MEDIA ATTENTION, AND REINFORCE THE UNCERTAINTY ABOUT THE SAFETY OF BIOTECHNOLOGY UNCLASSIFIED

PAGE 04 ROME 02999 04 OF 05 191329Z
IN THE MIND OF THE ITALIAN PUBLIC. WE NOTE, HOWEVER, THAT
RECENT ANTI-GMO DEMONSTRATIONS HAVE BEEN POORLY ATTENDED -EVEN THE JUNE 6-7 ANTIGLOBAL DEMONSTRATORS NUMBERED ONLY
10-12,000 INSTEAD OF THE 40,000 PREDICTED. MEDIA-COVERED
SCIENCE DEBATES LIKE THOSE REPORTED HERE ARE ONE COUNTERMEASURE WE CAN EMPLOY TO FURTHER USG POLICY ENDS.

119. (SBU) ACTION REQUEST: OES IS ASKED TO RESPOND TO ROME 1965 TRANSMITTED APRIL 22, 2002. THIS MESSAGE REQUESTS DEPARTMENT'S CONCURRENCE IN DISCUSSING COOPERATION ON BIOTECHNOLOGY RESEARCH, THROUGH A FORMAL BILATERAL MEETING AT THE EXPERT LEVEL, UNDER THE UMBRELLA SET AGREEMENT. THIS WILL ALLOW US TO TAKE FIRST MEASURES, AMONG THEM A AFFIRMATIVE RESPONSE TO OES/SCP'S SUGGESTION THAT EST COUNS AND A GOI REP EXAMINE THE US-EU BIOTECH TASKFORCE AS AN (SBU) ACTION REQUEST: OES IS ASKED TO RESPOND TO ROME

ADMINISTRATIVE MODEL, AND ATTEND A SESSION OF THE TASK FORCE AS OBSERVERS, AND AS A WAY TO RELATE POSSIBLE BILATERAL COOPERATION TO THE BROADER US-EU CONTEXT, CLEARLY SOMETHING THE GOI WISHES TO DO. IT WILL ALSO ALLOW US TO DISCUSS WITH THE GOI ITS HOPE OF CONVENING A BILATERAL MEETING OF EXPERTS SOMETIME BEFORE THE END OF 2002. EMBASSY BELIEVES THAT A SCIENCE-BASED APPROACH TO THE GOI ON BIOTECH, SUPPORTED THROUGH A BILATERAL AGREEMENT, CAN GIVE US AN EFFECTIVE WEDGE TO CONTINUE TO ISOLATE AND EXPOSE THE INTELLECTUAL INADEQUACY

UNCLASSIFIED

UNCLASSIFIED PTQ4240

PAGE 01 ROME 02999 05 OF 05 191329Z ACTION EUR-00

CEA-01 CIAE-00 COME-00
DOTE-00 SRPP-00 MEDE-00
UTED-00 VC-00 FRB-00
ITC-01 L-00 NASA-01
TEST-00 TRSE-00 USIE-00
NFAT-00 SAS-00 /011w INFO LOG-00 NP-00 EPAE-00 PMB-00 DRL-02 G-00 NFAT-00 SAS-00 ----BF7817 191329Z /38

R 191350Z JUN 02 R 19135UZ JUN UZ FM AMEMBASSY ROME TO SECSTATE WASHDC 4330 HQ EPA WASHDC USDA WASHDC NSC WASHDC INFO EU MEMBER STATES COLLECTIVE AMCONSUL FLORENCE AMCONSUL MILAN AMCONSUL NAPLES

UNCLAS SECTION 05 OF 05 ROME 002999

SIPDIS

SENSITIVE

STATE FOR SCIENCE ADVISOR NEUREITER EUR/ERA FOR HEN-NIL EB FOR GADSEN EB/TPP/ATT FOR PEREZ

UNCLASSIFIED

PAGE 02 ROME 02999 05 OF 02 E FOR SHUB
OES A/S TURNER, PDAS ROCK
STATE PASS USDA FOR APHIS:SMCCAMMON
USDA/FAS:BLUM
USDA/FAS/ITT:EJONES
USDA/FAS/OA:SLUTSKY ROME 02999 05 OF 05 191329Z USDA/OS/HEGWOOD STATE PASS FDA FOR EFLAMM EPA FOR OFFICE OF ADMINISTRATOR NSC FOR EDSON, CLOUD

E.O. 12958: N/A
TAGS: EAGR ETRD TSPL TBIO EAID IT ITEAGR ITEAGR ITEAGR SUBJECT: GOOD AND BAD SCIENCE TAKE CENTER STAGE IN BIOTECH

OF BIOTECH OPPONENTS, AND IN THE LONG RUN ERODE THE POLITICAL SUPPORT ALEMANNO AND HIS FOLLOWERS ENJOY NOT BY MERIT, BUT BY THE ABSENCE OF A STRONG AND WIDELY DISTRIBUTED COUNTER-MESSAGE.

120. (U) SCIENCE INTERN LEIGH SYLVAN CONTRIBUTED TO THE DRAFTING OF THIS MESSAGE. SEMBLER

UNCLASSIFIED

> 2002ROME02999 - Classification: UNCLASSIFIED